

1 Timothy Smith, Esq. (CA Bar No. 125534)
2 McKinley & Smith, A Professional Corporation
3 3445 American River Dr., Suite A
4 Sacramento, CA 95864
5 Tel: (916) 972-1333
6 Fax: (916) 972-1335

7 Steven Burlingham, Esq. (CA Bar No. 88544)
8 Gary, Till & Burlingham
9 5330 Madison Ave., Suite F
10 Sacramento, CA 95841
11 Tel: (916) 332-8112
12 Fax: (916) 332-8153
13 *Trial Counsel*

14 Gregory S. Baylor, Esq. (TX Bar No. 1941500)
15 Steven H. Aden, Esq. (DC Bar No. 466777)
16 Timothy J. Tracey, Esq. (GA Bar No. 715195)
17 Religious Liberty Advocates
18 of the Christian Legal Society
19 4208 Evergreen Lane, Suite 222
20 Annandale, VA 22003-3264
21 Tel: (703) 642-1070
22 Fax: (703) 642-1075
23 *Co-Counsel (Pro Hac Vice Admission Pending)*

24 Of Counsel:
25 Benjamin W. Bull, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 009940)
26 Gary S. McCaleb, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 018848)
27 Joshua W. Carden, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 021698)
28 Alliance Defense Fund
15333 North Pima Road, Suite 165
Scottsdale, AZ 85260
Tel: (800) 835-5233
Fax: (480) 444-0025
*Counsel for Plaintiff Christian Legal Society Chapter
of University California, Hastings College of the Law,
a/k/a Hastings Christian Fellowship*

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

CHRISTIAN LEGAL SOCIETY CHAPTER
OF UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA,
HASTINGS COLLEGE OF THE LAW, a/k/a
HASTINGS CHRISTIAN FELLOWSHIP, a
student organization at University of
California, Hastings College of the Law,

Plaintiff,

} CASE NO.

} VERIFIED COMPLAINT FOR
DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE
RELIEF

1 v.)
 2 MARY KAY KANE, in her official capacity as)
 3 Chancellor and Dean of University of)
 4 California, Hastings College of the Law; JUDY)
 5 CHAPMAN, in her official capacity as)
 6 Director of Student Services for University of)
 7 California, Hastings College of the Law; and)
 8 MAUREEN E. CORCORAN, EUGENE L.)
 9 FREELAND, CARIN T. FUJISAKI, JOHN T.)
 10 KNOX, JAN LEWENHAUPT, JAMES E.)
 11 MAHONEY, BRIAN D. MONAGHAN,)
 12 BRUCE L. SIMON, JOHN K. SMITH, and)
 13 TONY WEST, in their official capacities as the)
 14 Board of Directors of University of California,)
 15 Hastings College of the Law,)
 16 Defendants.)

17 COMES NOW Plaintiff, Christian Legal Society Chapter of University California,
 18 Hastings College of the Law, a/k/a Hastings Christian Fellowship (hereafter, “HCF”), by and
 19 through its undersigned counsel, Timothy Smith, Esq. and Steven Burlingham, Esq. and
 20 Gregory S. Baylor, Esq., Steven H. Aden, Esq. and Timothy J. Tracey, Esq., Religious Liberty
 21 Advocates of the Christian Legal Society, and Benjamin W. Bull, Esq., Gary S. McCaleb, Esq.,
 22 and Joshua W. Carden, Esq. of the Alliance Defense Fund, and hereby brings the following
 23 causes of action against Defendants Mary Kay Kane, in her official capacity as Chancellor and
 24 Dean of University of California, Hastings College of the Law; Judy Chapman, in her official
 25 capacity as Director of Student Services for University of California, Hastings College of the
 26 Law; and Maureen E. Corcoran, Eugene L. Freeland, Carin T. Fujisaki, John T. Knox, Jan
 27 Lewenhaupt, James E. Mahoney, Brian D. Monaghan, Bruce L. Simon, John K. Smith, and
 28 Tony West, in their official capacities as the Board of Directors of University of California,
 Hastings College of the Law. In support of its claims for relief, Plaintiff alleges and avers as
 follows:

26 ///
 27 ///
 28 ///

1 **Jurisdiction and Venue**

2 1.1 Plaintiff Hastings Christian Fellowship brings this civil rights action pursuant to
3 42 U.S.C. § 1983 and § 1988 for deprivations of Plaintiff’s rights secured by the First and
4 Fourteenth Amendments to the United States Constitution.

5 1.2 Jurisdiction is conferred on this Court by 28 U.S.C. §§ 1343(a)(3) and 1343(a)(4),
6 which provide for original jurisdiction in this Court of all suits brought pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §
7 1983. Jurisdiction is also conferred on this Court by 28 U.S.C. § 1331 because the cause of
8 action arises under the Constitution and laws of the United States. Venue is proper in this Court
9 pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) because, upon information and belief, the Defendants reside in
10 the Northern District of California and may be found and served in the Northern District of
11 California, and because a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to these claims
12 arose in this District.

13 1.3 Intradistrict Assignment: A substantial part of the events giving rise to this claim
14 occurred within the City and County of San Francisco.

15 **Parties**

16 2.1 Plaintiff Christian Legal Society Chapter of University California, Hastings
17 College of the Law, a/k/a Hastings Christian Fellowship is an unincorporated student
18 organization of University of California, Hastings College of the Law in San Francisco,
19 California. It is a local chapter of the national organization known as the Christian Legal
20 Society, an IRC 501(c)(3)-qualified religious professional membership organization. HCF is
21 capable of suing in its own name and has standing to bring this action in its own name and on
22 behalf of its individual members.

23 2.2 Defendant Mary Kay Kane is the Chancellor and Dean of University of
24 California, Hastings College of the Law, a public law school founded by the California State
25 Assembly and operated by the State of California. Her duties include, among others,
26 coordinating with the Board of Directors, implementing the policies of the Board, and
27 representing the University of California, Hastings College of the Law (“UC Hastings”) before
28 the California State Assembly. The Office of the Chancellor and Dean is located at 200

1 McAllister Street, San Francisco, California 94102. Chancellor Kane is sued in her official
2 capacity.

3 2.3 Defendant Judy Chapman is the Director of Student Services for University of
4 California, Hastings College of the Law. Her duties include, among others, oversight of the
5 registration of student organizations at UC Hastings and review of student initiated grievances
6 regarding discriminatory practices and violation of privacy rights. The Office of Student
7 Services is located at 200 McAllister Street, San Francisco, California 94102. Ms. Chapman is
8 sued in her official capacity.

9 2.4 Defendants Maureen E. Corcoran, Eugene L. Freeland, Carin T. Fujisaki, John T.
10 Knox, Jan Lewenhaupt, James E. Mahoney, Brian D. Monaghan, Bruce L. Simon, John K.
11 Smith, and Tony West are members of the Board of Directors of UC Hastings and are
12 responsible for, among other things, governance of UC Hastings. Their offices are located at 200
13 McAllister Street, San Francisco, California 94102. They are sued in their official capacities.

14 **Factual Background**

15 3.1 Christian Legal Society is a nationwide association of Christian lawyers, law
16 students, law professors, and judges. The organization's purposes include providing a means of
17 society, fellowship, and nurture among Christian lawyers; promoting justice, religious liberty,
18 and biblical conflict resolution; encouraging, discipling, and aiding Christian law students; and
19 encouraging lawyers to furnish legal services to the poor. In furtherance of its purposes, the
20 national Christian Legal Society organization maintains both attorney and law student chapters
21 across the country.

22 3.2 All members of the national Christian Legal Society, including student members,
23 must sign a Statement of Faith indicating that the member holds certain Christian viewpoints
24 commonly regarded in both the Roman Catholic and Protestant evangelical traditions as
25 orthodox. A true and correct copy of the New Member Application which includes the
26 Statement of Faith is attached as Exhibit A.

27 ///

28 ///

1 3.3 HCF is the local UC Hastings chapter of the national Christian Legal Society
2 organization. HCF is a student organization at UC Hastings, and, until the 2004-2005 academic
3 year, has been officially recognized by the College as a registered student organization.

4 3.4 HCF is governed by a chapter constitution. A true and correct copy of the HCF
5 Constitution is attached as Exhibit B.

6 3.5 Any student is welcome to participate in HCF meetings and other activities,
7 regardless of religion, sexual orientation, or membership or non-membership in any other
8 protected class. However, pursuant to the constitution and rules for CLS student chapters of the
9 national Christian Legal Society, HCF requires its members and officers to sign the national
10 Christian Legal Society's Statement of Faith.

11 3.6 HCF incorporates these officer and membership requirements into its chapter
12 constitution.

13 3.7 Specifically, HCF's Chapter Constitution provides:

14 All members and officers of this Chapter must agree to and affirm the following
15 Statement of Faith:

16 Trusting in Jesus Christ as my Savior, I believe in:

- 17 • One God, eternally existent in three persons, Father, Son and Holy Spirit.
- 18 • God the Father Almighty, Maker of heaven and earth.
- 19 • The Deity of our Lord, Jesus Christ, God's only Son conceived of the Holy
20 Spirit, born of the virgin Mary; His vicarious death for our sins through which
 we receive eternal life; His bodily resurrection and personal return.
- The presence and power of the Holy Spirit in the work of regeneration.
- The Bible as the inspired Word of God.

21 Exhibit B, at p. 1.

22 3.8 HCF interprets its Statement of Faith to require that officers adhere to orthodox
23 Christian beliefs based on the authority of the Bible, including the Bible's prohibition of sexual
24 conduct between persons of the same sex. A person who engages in homosexual conduct or
25 adheres to the viewpoint that homosexual conduct is not sinful would not be permitted to become
26 a member or serve as an HCF officer. A person who may have engaged in homosexual conduct
27 in the past but has repented of that conduct, or who has homosexual inclinations but does not
28 engage in or affirm homosexual conduct, would not be prevented from becoming a member or

1 serving as an officer.

2 3.9 The mission of HCF is to maintain a vibrant Christian law fellowship on the UC
3 Hastings campus which enables its members, individually and as a group, consistent with
4 Biblical orthodoxy, to fulfill the Christian mandate to love God and to love their neighbors as
5 themselves. Exhibit B, at p. 1.

6 3.10 HCF believes that in order to achieve its mission, and in compliance with Biblical
7 orthodoxy, it must require its members and officers to sign, affirm, and endeavor to live their
8 lives in a manner consistent with its Statement of Faith.

9 3.11 Individuals who refuse to adhere to HCF's Statement of Faith are not permitted to
10 be members or officers.

11 3.12 UC Hastings is a public law school located in San Francisco, California and part
12 of the University of California system of schools.

13 3.13 UC Hastings permits students to form and register "student organizations."

14 3.14 To date, UC Hastings has registered 54 student organizations ranging from the
15 Clara Foltz Feminist Association to Hastings Republicans. *See* UC Hastings College of the Law,
16 2004-2005 Registered Student Organizations. A true and correct copy of the UC Hastings
17 College of the Law, 2004-2005 Registered Student Organizations is attached as Exhibit C. Of
18 the 54 registered student organizations, only 3 are religious or spiritual student organizations.
19 *See id.*

20 3.15 Student groups at UC Hastings must be recognized as a "registered student
21 organization" in order to use College facilities for meetings or to receive funding. Recognition
22 as a UC Hastings student organization conveys numerous additional substantial benefits and
23 privileges. Additional benefits of forming a registered student organization include, but are not
24 limited to:

- 25 (a) Use of designated UC Hastings bulletin boards for announcements of interest to
26 organization members and the student body;
- 27 (b) Use of the Student Information Center for distribution of organization materials to
28 the UC Hastings community;

- 1 (c) Listing on the Office of Student Services’ website and any hard copy lists;
- 2 (d) Participation in the Student Organizations’ Faire;
- 3 (e) Access to all services offered by the Office of Student Services, including
- 4 organization consultation, workshops, financial consulting and training, and
- 5 publications;
- 6 (f) Access to UC Hastings’ publications, including the “Hastings Weekly;”
- 7 (g) Placement of organizational materials in 1L orientation packets;
- 8 (h) Listing organization announcements on classroom chalkboards;
- 9 (i) Placement of announcements in the Student Event Calendar, delivered weekly to
- 10 UC Hastings students via email; and
- 11 (j) Eligibility to enter into a License Agreement with UC Hastings for use of the
- 12 College name.

13 3.16 As a condition of becoming a “registered student organization” at UC Hastings
14 and thereby gaining access to the benefits and privileges enumerated above, the University
15 requires an organization to agree to and abide by the “Policies and Regulations Applying to
16 College Activities, Organizations and Students.” “All registered students organizations will
17 comply with the Policies and Regulations Apply to College Activities, Organizations and
18 Students as stated in the Handbook for Student Organizations.” University of California,
19 Hastings College of the Law, Student Organization Registration , p. 19. A true and correct copy
20 of University of California, Hastings College of the Law, Student Organization Registration is
21 attached as Exhibit D.

22 3.17 Among other things, the Policies and Regulations Applying to College Activities,
23 Organizations and Students require student organizations to abide by the Policy On
24 Nondiscrimination. A true and correct copy of the relevant Policies and Regulations Applying to
25 College Activities, Organizations and Students is attached as Exhibit E.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 3.18 The Policy on Nondiscrimination provides in pertinent part:

2 The University of California, Hastings College of the Law shall not discriminate
3 unlawfully on the basis of race, color, religion, national origin, ancestry,
4 disability, age, sex or sexual orientation. This nondiscrimination policy covers
5 admission, access and treatment in Hastings-sponsored programs and activities.

6 Exhibit E, at p. 69.

7 3.19 “All groups, including administration, faculty, student governments, College-
8 owned student residence facilities and programs sponsored by the College, are governed by” the
9 Policy on Nondiscrimination. Exhibit E, at p. 69. The policy precludes student organizations
10 from considering religion or sexual orientation in the selection of officers or members.

11 3.20 A student organization’s registration “must be approved by the Director of
12 Student Relations and Service at the beginning of each academic year” in order to affirm the
13 group’s compliance with UC Hastings’ policies and to ensure the Office of Student Services has
14 up-to-date information concerning officers and members. Exhibit E, at p. 66.

15 3.21 If a student organization violates any law or policy of UC Hastings, including the
16 Policy on Nondiscrimination, “they will be subject to revocation of registration, loss of
17 privileges, or other sanctions for violation of such policies or regulations.” Exhibit E, at p. 67.

18 **Recent Developments**

19 4.1 In early September 2004, HCF submitted its constitution and registration form to
20 Defendant Judy Chapman for the annual renewal of its registered status with the UC Hastings’
21 Office of Student Services.

22 4.2 HCF’s constitution stated that the group would not discriminate on the basis of
23 race, color, national origin, ancestry, disability, age, or sex. However, HCF maintained,
24 consistent with a Biblically orthodox faith, that it would still consider religion and sexual
25 orientation in the selection of officers and members.

26 4.3 Defendant Chapman warned HCF co-leaders, Dina Haddad and Isaac Fong, that
27 HCF’s disagreement with UC Hastings’ Policy on Nondiscrimination would likely bar the group
28 from status as a registered student organization.

1 4.4 On or about September 23, 2004, HCF hand-delivered to Defendant Chapman a
2 letter providing a brief overview of the membership and leadership policies of the Christian
3 Legal Society and a synopsis of the pertinent law which HCF believed favored Defendant
4 Chapman approving HCF's registration form.

5 4.5 On or about October 1, 2004, UC Hastings informed HCF that "to be one of our
6 student-recognized organizations, [HCF] must open its membership to all students irrespective of
7 their religious beliefs or sexual orientation." Letter from UC Hastings to HCF dated October 1,
8 2004. A true and correct copy of the Letter from UC Hastings to HCF dated October 1, 2004 is
9 attached Exhibit F.

10 4.6 On or about October 12, 2004, Ms. Haddad received an email from Defendant
11 Chapman informing her that the \$250.00 in student activities funds set aside for HCF officers to
12 travel to the Christian Legal Society's National Conference had been withdrawn.

13 4.7 Since receiving the October 1, 2004 letter from UC Hastings, HCF has been
14 denied access to classroom chalkboards, bulletin boards, and all other channels of
15 communications in order to announce its meetings or recruit members from the UC Hastings
16 community.

17 4.8 HCF desires the privileges and status of being recognized by UC Hastings as a
18 registered student organization.

19 4.9 HCF objects to the Policy on Nondiscrimination that requires HCF to open its
20 membership and officer positions to all students regardless of religion or sexual orientation.

21 4.10 HCF's objections to the Policy on Nondiscrimination stem from its members'
22 sincerely held religious beliefs.

23 4.11 HCF does not object to the University policies forbidding discrimination on the
24 basis of race, color, national origin, ancestry, disability, age, or sex.

25 4.12 By enacting and enforcing the Policy on Nondiscrimination forbidding HCF to
26 discriminate on the basis of religion or sexual orientation, refusing to recognize HCF's
27 constitutional right to an exemption from said policy, and withholding from HCF the status and
28 benefits of a registered student organization, UC Hastings has engaged in discrimination against

1 HCF and its members based on the content and viewpoint of their speech and sent a message of
2 exclusion and disfavor of HCF and its members by Defendants, resulting in a chilling impact on
3 HCF's efforts at recruitment, association and dissemination of its message.

4 4.13 All alleged acts of the Defendants, their officers, agents, servants, employees, or
5 persons acting at their behest or direction, were done and are continuing to be done under the
6 color of state law, including the statutes, regulations, customs, policies and usages of the State of
7 California, and pursuant to policies and/or customs established by UC Hastings through
8 Defendants.

9 4.14 Unless and until enforcement of the Defendants' policies regarding the Policy on
10 Nondiscrimination is enjoined, HCF and its members and similarly situated religious
11 organizations will suffer and continue to suffer irreparable harm to their federal and state rights
12 of free association, freedom of speech and free exercise of religion.

13 COUNT I

14 FREEDOM OF EXPRESSIVE ASSOCIATION
15 UNITED STATES CONST. AMEND. I

16 5.1 HCF restates and realleges each allegation set forth in paragraphs 1.1 through
17 4.13 as if set forth verbatim herein.

18 5.2 By enacting and enforcing the Policy on Nondiscrimination forbidding HCF to
19 discriminate on the basis of religion or sexual orientation, refusing to recognize HCF's
20 constitutional right to an exemption from said policy, withholding from HCF the status and
21 benefits of a registered student organization, and engaging in direct and subtle forms of
22 retaliation against HCF and its members, Defendants have violated and will continue to violate
23 the right to freedom of expressive association guaranteed to HCF and its members by the First
24 Amendment to the United States Constitution and made applicable to the states and their political
25 subdivisions by the Fourteenth Amendment.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 COUNT II

2 FREE SPEECH
3 UNITED STATES CONST. AMEND. I

4 6.1 HCF restates and realleges each allegation set forth in paragraphs 1.1 through 5.2
5 as if set forth verbatim herein.

6 6.2 By enacting and enforcing the Policy on Nondiscrimination forbidding HCF to
7 discriminate on the basis of religion or sexual orientation, refusing to recognize HCF's
8 constitutional right to an exemption from said policy, withholding from HCF the status and
9 benefits of a registered student organization, and engaging in direct and subtle forms of
10 retaliation against HCF and its members, Defendants have violated and will continue to violate
11 the right to free speech guaranteed to HCF and its members by the First Amendment to the
12 United States Constitution and made applicable to the states and their political subdivisions by
13 the Fourteenth Amendment.

14 COUNT III

15 ESTABLISHMENT CLAUSE
16 UNITED STATES CONST. AMEND. I

17 7.1 HCF restates and realleges each allegation set forth in paragraphs 1.1 through 6.2
18 as if set forth verbatim herein.

19 7.2 By enacting and enforcing the Policy on Nondiscrimination forbidding HCF to
20 discriminate on the basis of religion or sexual orientation, refusing to recognize HCF's
21 constitutional right to an exemption from said policy, withholding from HCF the status and
22 benefits of a registered student organization, and engaging in direct and subtle forms of
23 retaliation against HCF and its members, Defendants have violated and will continue to violate
24 the Establishment Clause of the First Amendment to the United States Constitution and made
25 applicable to the states and their political subdivisions by the Fourteenth Amendment.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

///

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

COUNT IV
DUE PROCESS
UNITED STATES CONST. AMEND. XIV

8.1 HCF restates and realleges each allegation set forth in paragraphs 1.1 through 7.2 as if set forth verbatim herein.

8.2 By adopting the University Nondiscrimination Policy that fails to provide HCF with fair notice as to whether or not its leadership and membership practices comply with the nondiscrimination requirement and tasking University officials with enforcing the Policy on Nondiscrimination without providing criteria or guidelines to govern its enforcement, Defendants have violated and will continue to violate the right of due process guaranteed to HCF and its members by the Fourteenth Amendment to the United States Constitution.

COUNT V
FREE EXERCISE CLAUSE
UNITED STATE CONST. AMEND I

9.1 HCF restates and realleges each allegation set forth in paragraphs 1.1 through 8.2 as if set forth verbatim herein.

9.2 By enacting and enforcing the Policy on Nondiscrimination forbidding HCF to discriminate on the basis of religion or sexual orientation, refusing to recognize HCF's constitutional right to an exemption from said policy, withholding from HCF the status and benefits of a registered student organization, and engaging in direct and subtle forms of retaliation against HCF and its members, Defendants have violated and will continue to violate the right to free exercise of religion guaranteed to HCF and its members by the First Amendment to the United States Constitution and made applicable to the states and their political subdivisions by the Fourteenth Amendment.

///
///
///
///

- 1 (3) An award of reasonable costs and attorneys' fees incurred by Plaintiff in
2 prosecuting this action pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1988; and
3 (4) Such other and further relief as the Court deems just and proper under the
4 circumstances.

5 Respectfully submitted this 21st day of October, 2004.

6
7
8 Timothy Smith, Esq. (CA Bar No. 125534)
McKinley & Smith, A Professional Corporation
3445 American River Dr., Suite A
9 Sacramento, CA 95864
Tel: (916) 972-1333
10 Fax: (916) 972-1335

11 Steven Burlingham, Esq. (CA Bar No. 88544)
Gary, Till & Burlingham
12 5330 Madison Ave., Suite F
Sacramento, CA 95841
13 Tel: (916) 332-8112
Fax: (916) 332-8153
14 *Trial Counsel*

15 Gregory S. Baylor, Esq. (TX Bar No. 1941500)
Steven H. Aden, Esq. (DC Bar No. 466777)
16 Timothy J. Tracey, Esq. (GA Bar No. 715195)
Religious Liberty Advocates of the
17 Christian Legal Society
4208 Evergreen Lane, Suite 222
18 Annandale, VA 22003-3264
Tel: (703) 642-1070
19 Fax: (703) 642-1075
Co-Counsel(Pro Hac Vice Admission Pending)

20 Of Counsel:

21 Benjamin W. Bull, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 009940)
22 Gary S. McCaleb, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 018848)
Joshua W. Carden, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 021698)
23 Alliance Defense Fund
15333 North Pima Road Suite 165
24 Scottsdale, AZ 85260
Tel: (800) 835-5233
25 Fax: (480) 444-0025
*Counsel for Plaintiff Christian Legal Society Chapter of University
26 California, Hastings College of the Law, a/k/a Hastings Christian
Fellowship*

27 ///

28 ///

1
2 VERIFICATION

3 I, Isaac Fong, a citizen of the United States and a resident of the State of California, am a
4 Co-Leader of the Christian Legal Society Chapter of University of California, Hastings College
5 of the Law, a/k/a Hastings Christian Fellowship. I have read the foregoing Verified Complaint
6 for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief and declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the
7 United States of America that the foregoing factual averments are true and correct to the best of
8 my knowledge and belief.

9 CHRISTIAN LEGAL SOCIETY CHAPTER OF
10 UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, HASTINGS
11 COLLEGE OF THE LAW, a/k/a HASTINGS
12 CHRISTIAN FELLOWSHIP

13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Isaac Fong
Co-Leader